

Marten, Heiko F.

**Nicolson, Margaret & MacIver, Matthew (Eds.). (2003). Gaelic Medium Education (Policy and Practice in Education, vol. 10), Edinburgh: Dunedin Academic Press, 79 pp., £ 11,95 ; Grant, Nigel (2000). Multicultural Education in Scotland (Policy and Practice in Education, vol. 3), Edinburgh: Dunedin Academic Press, 72 pp., £ 9,95 [Rezension]**

*Tertium comparationis 10 (2004) 1, S. 133-136*

urn:nbn:de:0111-opus-33142

in Kooperation mit / in cooperation with:



<http://www.waxmann.com>

### **Nutzungsbedingungen / conditions of use**

Gewährt wird ein nicht exklusives, nicht übertragbares, persönliches und beschränktes Recht auf Nutzung dieses Dokuments. Dieses Dokument ist ausschließlich für den persönlichen, nicht-kommerziellen Gebrauch bestimmt. Die Nutzung stellt keine Übertragung des Eigentumsrechts an diesem Dokument dar und gilt vorbehaltlich der folgenden Einschränkungen: Auf sämtlichen Kopien dieses Dokuments müssen alle Urheberrechtshinweise und sonstigen Hinweise auf gesetzlichen Schutz beibehalten werden. Sie dürfen dieses Dokument nicht in irgendeiner Weise abändern, noch dürfen Sie dieses Dokument für öffentliche oder kommerzielle Zwecke vervielfältigen, öffentlich ausstellen, aufführen, vertreiben oder anderweitig nutzen.

We grant a non-exclusive, non-transferable, individual and limited right to using this document. This document is solely intended for your personal, non-commercial use. Use of this document does not include any transfer of property rights and it is conditional to the following limitations: All of the copies of this documents must retain all copyright information and other information regarding legal protection. You are not allowed to alter this document in any way, to copy it for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the document in public, to perform, distribute or otherwise use the document in public.

Mit der Verwendung dieses Dokuments erkennen Sie die Nutzungsbedingungen an.  
By using this particular document, you accept the above-stated conditions of use.

### **Kontakt / Contact:**

**peDOCS**  
Deutsches Institut für Internationale Pädagogische Forschung (DIPF)  
Mitglied der Leibniz-Gemeinschaft  
Informationszentrum (IZ) Bildung  
Schloßstr. 29, D-60486 Frankfurt am Main  
E-Mail: [pedocs@dipf.de](mailto:pedocs@dipf.de)  
Internet: [www.pedocs.de](http://www.pedocs.de)

gruppen, Ausdruck von Grundrechten und Pluralität, kann immer nur abgemildert, nicht aber aufgelöst werden.

Der Band ist in seinem zirkulären Umgang mit dem Thema interessant und informativ, lesenswert und nicht zuletzt auch gut lesbar. Zwei kritische Hinweise seien gleichwohl nicht unterschlagen: Mir erscheint das dichotomische Normalitätskonstrukt, das dem Systematisierungsansatz zugrunde gelegt wird, in einigen Elementen reichlich holzschnittartig und klischeehaft. Bei dem Umgang mit den Kategorien des (Minderheiten-)Schulrechts (z.B. mit KMK-Beschlüssen) bestehen Unsicherheiten und einschlägige neuere Literatur bleibt unberücksichtigt. Die Autoren halten Vorkenntnisse der Leser zur Schul- und Bildungsgeschichte, zur (Minderheiten-)Politik- und zur Sozialgeschichte für wünschenswert (S. 12). Gleichwohl bieten sie zu den Minderheitengruppen Grundinformationen, die zwangsläufig ergänzungsbedürftig sind. Dies wie die wiederholte Leseransprache und -führung durch den Text lässt nach dem angedachten Leserkreis fragen. Einerseits ist der (populär-)wissenschaftlich vermittelnde Charakter des Buches unübersehbar; andererseits verlässt er mit den Kapiteln zum Normalitätskonstrukt und Analyse-schema diesen allgemeinen Leserkreis. Mir scheint der Band deshalb am besten Studierenden im Grundstudium zu empfehlen zu sein.

Lutz R. Reuter  
Universität der Bundeswehr Hamburg

Nicolson, Margaret & MacIver, Matthew (Eds.). (2003). *Gaelic Medium Education* (Policy and Practice in Education, vol. 10), Edinburgh: Dunedin Academic Press, 79 pp., £ 11,95

Grant, Nigel (2000). *Multicultural Education in Scotland* (Policy and Practice in Education, vol. 3), Edinburgh: Dunedin Academic Press, 72 pp., £ 9,95

Minority Languages in Scotland from an Educational Point of View

The position of the Gaelic language in Scotland has seen considerable improvement in recent years. Especially since the decentralisation of power in the UK, which resulted in the establishment of a Scottish Parliament, Gaelic policy has come into focus a lot more. Despite the fact that opposition remains strong in parts of Scottish society, awareness for Gaelic as a part of Scottish identity has risen in the past decades. The aim of activists at present is to counterwork the decline of speakers (down to less than 60,000 in the 2001 census), and to lay the groundwork for increased presence and use of the Gaelic language in all parts of Scotland and Scottish society.

The volume *Gaelic Medium Education* (2003) is edited by Margaret Nicolson, a Language Lecturer at the Open University of Scotland, and Matthew MacIver, the Chief Executive and Registrar of the Scottish General Teaching Council. They make a worthy effort to present latest developments and issues in one of the most fundamental parts of Gaelic maintenance and revitalisation policies: the educational sector. A strong asset of the volume is that its chapters provide an introduction from the differing angles of the fields directly involved in these policy processes. D. J. MacLeod,

who is the Scottish Highland Council responsible for Gaelic Medium Education (GME) development, starts with a historical introduction. Wilson McLeod of the University of Edinburgh's Celtic and Scottish Studies Department then presents a comparison of minority language policy in several European contexts from a language policy research point of view. Rosemary Ward, Quality Improvement Officer of the Education Service of the Argyll and Bute Region, provides an introduction to the school perspective. Jean Nisbert from the East Ayrshire local council reports from the Local Authority experience. The volume is rounded up by the editors presenting an evaluation and a perspective for the years to come.

*Gaelic Medium Education* is number 10 of the *Policy and Practice in Education* series, edited by Gordon Kirk and Robert T. D. Glaister, members of the Educational Faculties of the University of Edinburgh and the Open University in Scotland respectively. It links with another volume relating to Gaelic, the series' number 3, Nigel Grant's *Multicultural Education in Scotland* (2000). Grant provides a short introduction into multiculturalism and relates it to present-day Scotland. He starts with a general discussion of the concepts of identity and culture, followed by an introduction into the multicultural reality of Scotland and threats and opposition to it. He then relates this to the situation in other countries, and culminates in a strong plea for more recognition of multiculturalism in Scotland as a whole and education in particular. Gaelic appears as one aspect in this; an overview is provided of the Gaelic language's and culture's history, as well as modern demography and its position within the educational system.

Grant's book is extremely comprehensive and suitable for beginners in the field; however, there is nothing really new for the more advanced readers in multiculturalism. For them, the volume will only be of interest if they wish to have a specific introduction on the Scottish situation. Readers with an interest in Gaelic will find that the information relevant to them is spread throughout the text, without a specific chapter on Gaelic (and without an index that would make searching for Gaelic much easier). They should rather stick to the volume that focuses on GME.

As Nicolson and MacIver comment in their introduction, their volume aims at providing an overview of developments in order to raise awareness for Gaelic Education issues, as well as minority languages in general. It addresses policy makers as well as a general readership usually not involved in Gaelic activism. In particular, for the latter purpose, the moderate extent of the volume is suitable, including its extremely comprehensive chapters, each of which provides a useful introduction on the numerous perspectives involved. In addition, the chapters not only provide an overview, but also give an evaluation of achievements and tasks for the future.

As a whole, the underlying tone of the book is carefully optimistic. This refers to all chapters: The first chapter provides an overview of the historical development of GME since the late 19<sup>th</sup> century. It focuses on the rapid growth of Gaelic medium pre-school and school education since the opening of the first such classes in the 1980s, and on the interest taken by more and more Scots in the field. Another part of the chapter is dedicated to the development of the sup-

port infrastructure, such as teacher training programmes, academic research and the establishment of a number of interest groups. MacLeod concludes with an evaluation: Despite the achievements that have resulted in an infrastructure without precedence, GME has still not reached the point of speaker number reproduction. Even if demand for GME is increasing in most parts of Scotland, student figures in the Gaelic heartland are still declining considerably.

The second chapter presents a comparative view on language policy developments in Wales, the Basque Country and Ireland. McLeod portrays models of minority language education and the obstacles faced by these, and explains parallels in issues such as programme and teaching material development. The three examples are presented as largely successful: Starting at a similar point of departure as in Scotland, they have proven that the establishment of minority language education is possible and may result in a reversal of language shift and attitudes towards the language. However, he concludes that it ultimately depends on the will of the people of Scotland and Scottish politicians whether a similar success can be achieved when it comes to Gaelic.

The school perspective is discussed in Chapter 3. One urgent problem that is raised is the language barrier – for example, the lack of understanding and support by head-teachers due to the limited knowledge of Gaelic, despite there generally being a positive attitude. Other obstacles discussed are the extra amount of management time a Gaelic unit takes within schools, or the lack of qualified teachers that often renders even desired Gaelic education impossible. Ward then

draws attention to how Gaelic Medium pupils may be integrated into the rest of the school, to the distinct methodological problems of GME and specific issues of Gaelic immersion and bilingual classes. She concludes by demanding a comprehensive strategy of the Scottish Executive. Given the limited funding for GME, the isolated policy efforts and experiences should be united under one roof for the benefit of the large needs within GME.

In Chapter 4, Nisbet starts her account of the local authorities' role in GME by stressing the manifoldness of organisations local councils have to deal with, and the problems that arise when paying justice to all interests. A major step in Gaelic funding was the introduction of centrally-administered Gaelic Specific Grants in the 1980s, which gave local authorities a certain planning stability. Nisbet then comments on the various models of GME supported by local authorities over the years and stresses the importance of more evaluative research on Gaelic issues and, again, teacher training. She rounds up by also expressing the hope that the establishment of the Scottish Parliament and the Bòrd na Gàidhlig will eventually result in a comprehensive strategy for the future of Gaelic.

Finally, Margaret Nicolson and Matthew MacIver give a summarising analysis of the state of affairs in GME, in three contexts: Linguistics, Education, and Politics. Linguistically, the authors are in line with Grant's volume in calling for a debate on the perceived monolingual culture in Scotland, the role of language issues for Scottish identity, and the place of Gaelic in this context. From an educational point of view, they stress the role

of languages in Scotland's schools in general and of Gaelic in particular. In this respect, they draw attention to the historical discrimination against Gaelic and the resulting differences in today's needs of Gaelic education, depending on the individuals' previous Gaelic knowledge and local demography. Politically, Nicolson and MacIver point to a secure legal status for Gaelic, a wider integration of Gaelic into the educational system, and the prevailing lack of support among many politicians, despite various counter-examples. In their summary, the authors draw a moderately positive conclusion: On the one hand, they call GME "one of the success stories of recent Scottish education". On the other hand, several major issues remain unsolved, and "if Gaelic as a language is to survive into the next century, ..., then GME will require attention as one of several key language planning factors central to the survival policy".

To sum up, the aim of the book in providing an introduction on current Gaelic Medium Education, including its historical background, is well achieved. The texts are easy to read and are well supported by statistical data. Given its limitedness of only 73 text pages, one can deduct that an extended analysis was not the aim of the editors. Readers who wish to have such a detailed analysis should consult the detailed bibliography (covering titles up to the year 2002). However, for all those that are looking for a short, general introduction into GME, the volume nicely fulfils its purpose.

Heiko F. Marten  
Freie Universität Berlin

Schroll-Machl, Sylvia (2003). *Doing Business with Germans. Their Perception, Our Perception*. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 216 pp., 24,90 €.

Due to the process of globalization, cultural differences are no longer a matter of interest to tourists and scientific research, but have become part of the daily life of many. A vast amount of knowledge about culture is necessary in order to successfully manage international business, as Alexander Thomas claims in the foreword to this book (p. 9).

Germany is an important player in international business, therefore many people world-wide are working with Germans, and many Germans come into contact with foreigners.

*Doing Business with Germans. Their Perception, Our Perception* by Sylvia Schroll-Machl specifically addresses members of both groups. The author, an intercultural trainer with a background in psychological research, provides the readers with information about the 'cultural logic' of their own and the other's behavior, in order to enhance their intercultural competence.

Schroll-Machl uses four chapters to address both the theoretical and practical issues of German culture. The introductory chapter (7 pages) explains not only the relevance of understanding the 'cultural logic' of other's and one's own 'culture standards' to intercultural competence, but also informs the reader that the book describes *probabilities* and does not try to explain the behavior of each German individual without exceptions.

The following chapter (12 pages) provides the reader with an explanation of the concept of 'culture standards'. On the